



**Captain J J Taylor OBE Royal Navy**  
 Captain Base Safety



Room 1/P  
 Howard Block  
 Building B128  
 HM Naval Base Devonport  
 PLYMOUTH  
 Devon  
 PL2 2BG

Tel: 01752 557282  
 MOD: 93 75 67282  
 Fax: 01752 55735

Email: DES NBCD-CBS-CBS

See Distribution

BNSO/160/521/1

Date: 15 Mar 10

**MINUTES OF THE LOCAL LIAISON COMMITTEE (LLC) MEETING HELD ON WEDNESDAY 10 DECEMBER AT WELCOME HALL, DEVONPORT.**

<p>Present</p>	<p>Cdre I Jess ADC, Naval Base Commander (NBC(D)), HMNB Devonport.          Mr R Hardy, Managing Director Submarines, Babcock Marine.          Captain JJ Taylor, Captain Base Safety (CBS), HMNB Devonport.          Mr G Perritt, Head of Continuous Improvement, Plymouth City Council.          Dr A Francis, Director of Nuclear Safety and Quality (DNSQ), Babcock Marine.          Mr R Clark, Radiation Protection Advisor (SHPRPA), HMNB Devonport.          Lt N Smith, Nuclear Emergency Response Officer, HMNB Devonport.          Surgeon Commander P Benton, Naval Medical Officer of Health, HMNB Devonport.          Dr P Naylor, Devonport Site Inspector, Environment Agency (EA).          Mr P Wheddon, Principal Inspector, Defence Nuclear Safety Regulator (DNSR).          Mr D Black, Principal Inspector, Defence Nuclear Safety Regulator (DNSR).          Mr M Moore, Health and Safety Executive, Nuclear Installations Inspectorate (NII).          Mr S Wilkins, Emergency Planning Officer, Devon and Cornwall Constabulary.          Ms C Norris, Devon and Cornwall Constabulary.          Prof Cllr D Salter, Plymouth City Council.          Ms N Horne, Environmental Protection Manager, Plymouth City Council.          Ms W Smith, Corporate Affairs Manager, Babcock Marine.          Mr B Wright, Environmental Radiation Policy Manager, Babcock Marine.</p>	<p>Chairman</p>
----------------	---	-----------------

	<p>Ms L Coulton, MOD Press Office South West, MOD.  Miss M Clark, Health Physicist, Babcock Marine.  Mr B Philips, Emergency Planning Manager, Babcock Marine.  Mr G Wheeler, LLC Member, Plymouth City Council.  Mr A Slater, Emergency Planning Officer, Cornwall Council.  Cllr B Hobbs, LLC Member, Cornwall Council.  Cllr C Riches, LLC Member, Cornwall Council.  Cllr J Squire, LLC Member, South Hams District Council.  Mrs R Robilliard, Babcock Marine.  Mr B Tonks, Inspector, MOD Police.  Mr D Trejorrow, Constable, MOD Police.  Ms H Collis, Western Morning News.  Mr D Jeff, Reporter, Plymouth Evening Herald.  Mrs R Stevens, Member of Public.  Mrs J Pollard, Member of Public.  Mr I Avent, CANSAR.  Mrs M Scott, Technical Support Officer, HMNB Devonport.  Mr M Homer, Engineering Director, Babcock Marine.  Mr M Smith, Future Facilities, Babcock Marine.  Mr P Daybell, SERCO Assurance.  Mr A Koshti, Member of Public.  Mr R Carton, Public Protection Service Manager, Plymouth City Council.  Mrs V Woodruff, Civil Protection Office, Plymouth City Council.  W Parsons, Member of Public.  Mr S Beresford-Foster, Cornwall Council.</p>	Secretary
<p><b>Item 1 - Chairman's opening remarks</b></p> <p>1. The Chairman opened the meeting with introductions of all present on the top table:</p> <p>Captain J J Taylor, Captain Base Safety HMNB Devonport  Dr A Francis, Director of Nuclear Safety and Quality Babcock Marine  Mr Roger Hardy, Managing Director Submarines, Babcock Marine  Mr Giles Perritt, Lead for Civil Protection, Plymouth City Council</p> <p>2. The Chair reminded all present of the protocol for LLC meetings, under which questions could only be raised by Committee members, any public questions should have been forwarded by members of the public to their representatives on the committee prior to the meeting. Despite this he suggested that such questions could be asked after the short break following item 6, after the first 3 main presentations had been given.</p>		Action
<p><b>Item 2 - Apologies</b></p> <p>Peter Dale South Hams District Council  Captain J Edgell COMDEVFLOT Ministry of Defence  Debra Laphorne Director of Public Health Plymouth Primary Care Trust  Miranda Marklew Devon and Somerset Fire and Rescue Service  Mark Kealy Health Protection Agency  Neil Vine Emergency Planning Manager NHS Plymouth</p>		

<p><b>Item 3 - Minutes and matters arising from last meeting</b></p> <p>3. The minutes of the last meeting were agreed and accepted.</p> <p>4. The action arising from the meeting before last was confirmed as complete, there were no actions from the previous meeting.</p>	
<p><b>Item 4 - HMNB Operations</b></p> <p>5. CBS gave a presentation on current issues at HMNB Devonport.</p>	
<p><b>Item 5 - DRDL Operations</b></p> <p>6. DNSQ gave a presentation covering key safety and operational issues including updates since the Jul 08 meeting.</p>	
<p><b>Item 6 - Plymouth City Council (PCC) Issues</b></p> <p>7. Mr G Perritt, Head of Continuous Improvement, Plymouth City Council gave a presentation on PCC specific issues.</p>	
<p><b>Questions Raised from the floor</b></p> <p>8. Following a break for coffee questions were accepted from the floor. The Chairman asked that questions which concerned HMS TRAFALGAR were withheld until after the presentation from the Environment Agency</p> <p>Qu 1. Professor Salter: will there be any involvement of agencies or stakeholders “outside the wall” for the Reference Accident demonstration?</p> <p>A. Dr Francis confirmed that there were two demonstration exercise planned this year. The first was the annual demonstration exercise in early July that was essentially for Naval Base personnel, Dockyard personnel and the regulators with input from emergency responders on site. Short Sermon 2010 in October would include all agencies and stakeholders.</p> <p>Qu 2. Cllr Wheeler: reference the Submarine dismantling project is there any reason to believe that there should be an adverse effect on public health?</p> <p>A. CBS replied by stating that there would be no adverse effect to public health, and referred to Babcock as the main Stakeholders dealing with submarine dismantling. NBC added that, as part of the technology demonstrator process, as hazards are identified appropriate mitigation will be put in place to minimise the hazard to one which is reasonably practicable and which is regulated by the appropriate regulator. Mr Mike Moore HSE regulator added that were the dismantling project to come to Devonport it would not significantly change hazards on the site.</p> <p>Qu 3. Cllr Wheeler asked what the current consultation time was for the Submarine Dismantling process.</p> <p>A. NBC replied that debates were in process with the twelve potential sites and that subject to the various discussions and consultations it is projected that the process</p>	

<p>would not reach the Public Consultation phase before autumn 2010; although this suggests a period of time without information this would not be the case as the Submarine Dismantling Programme website will updated with regular progress reports.</p> <p>Qu 4 Cllr Wheeler then asked when a significant update takes place could the members of the LLC be notified.</p> <p>A. NBC advised that this action would be taken away and discuss with the project team.</p> <p>Qu 5 Cllr Wheeler asked NBC to confirm what he meant with regards to elected members involved in the preliminary debates at the twelve potential sites?</p> <p>A. NBC replied local MPs and leaders of councils.</p> <p>Qu 6. Mr Avent: how was the burst hose clamp discovered?</p> <p>A. CBS it was discovered during a routine test of the hose system by putting air through the system.</p> <p>Qu 7. Mr Avent made a statement that he sat on the Submarine Dismantling Advisory Group and that wherever the Technical Demonstrator for one submarine was created (in adherence to regulatory standards) it was unlikely that another facility would then be used for the remainder of the submarines. Mr Avent then suggested that the twelve sites mentioned earlier were for the storage of intermediate waste, not for cutting up and dismantling, where only two sites were under consideration: Rosyth and Devonport.</p> <p>A. NBC replied that he accepted all of the points and with regards to the twelve sites he confirmed that it had previously been stated that some were for storage and some for dismantling.</p> <p>However NBC did state that he did not entirely accept the statement regarding the siting of the Technical Demonstrator because that in itself is subject to consultation with links to the consultation of the final siting before any decision is made and people are informed.</p> <p>Qu 8. Cllr Wheeler asked for a clear definition of the roll of a Technical Demonstrator and the consultation process?</p> <p>A. The consultation process will cover both the process to be used for the project in due course and will consult on the Technology Demonstrator project.</p> <p>Qu 9. Mr Rees expressed his concern about Nuclear waste blowing over the city due to emissions, would any Low Level waste be burnt in any of the incinerators proposed for the Naval Base Site and the second part are there any alternatives to Nuclear propulsions for the submarines?</p> <p>A. NBC replied in answer to the second part no, there are no alternatives to Nuclear propulsion. Dr Naylor added that there were no plans to burn Low Level waste in the incinerators; he confirmed there was no authority to do so and if it was ever proposed an application would have to be made to the Environment Agency.</p> <p>Qu 10. Cllr wheeler asked is there likely to be significant involvement of the general public during Short sermon 2010?</p>	<p><b>NBC(D)</b></p>
---	----------------------

<p>A. Cllr Perritt replied the plan for Short Sermon 2010 will include lessons learnt from Short sermon 2004 and Short Sermon 2007. Observers will be involved but there will be a balance due to the numbers of people involved.</p> <p>9. There being no further questions at this stage the meeting continued with Item 7.</p>	
<p><b>Item 7 - Environment Agency</b></p> <p>10. Dr P Naylor of the EA gave his presentation.</p> <p>11. After the presentation several questions were asked:</p> <p>Qu 11. Mr Rees reported that he has requested from South West Water information on farms that received “commercial sewage sludge” for use on agricultural land but has not received the information.</p> <p>A. Dr Naylor replied that when radioactive discharges are authorised to the sewer, the EA has to look at potential radioactive risks to sewage workers and consumption of food grown on farms; he confirmed that there is no way of identifying “Devonport sludge”. South West Water does not provide details of their sludge recycling activities. EA does sample sewer sludge and agricultural land around the country but not around Plymouth to date as disposal to sewage is well under limits but have asked for Plymouth to be included.</p>	
<p><b>Item 8 – Items raised by members</b></p> <p>12. The Chair Introduced Mr P Wheddon, DNSR and Mr M Moore NII who were available to answer any questions from the committee in addition to any of the panel or previous speakers.</p>	
<p><b>Item 9 - Items from the floor</b></p> <p>Mrs Pollard submitted a letter regarding the storage, disposal and transportation of Nuclear waste. This letter has been subdivided with replies coming from PCC, the EA and MoD a written reply is being co-ordinated by the MoD.</p> <p>Qu 12. Mrs Stevens expressed concern that background radiation from historic releases will not go away. Are the Emergency Services really involved in Short Sermon? There is also concern about radiation exposure to Emergency Services in the event of a real nuclear emergency if so would they be withdrawn? The proposed incinerator is also a big worry as this presents another set of risks.</p> <p>A. Dr Naylor replied the historic releases do not include any discharges from Devonport and background radiation is reducing. Cllr Perritt confirmed that the Emergency Services were fully involved in both the planning and execution of Short Sermon 2010. With regards to the incinerator NBC pointed out that this is a project organised by South West Devon Waste Partnership to deal with domestic waste not commercial waste (i.e. no waste from the Naval Base) and will be subject to consultation.</p> <p>Qu 13 Mrs Stevens expressed concern that information regarding the incinerator is not being given out; she is worried about increased traffic and that commercial non-recycled waste will be burnt.</p> <p>A. Mr Perritt noted the remarks the incinerator will be subject to full planning and democratic processes and suggested that this particular concern regarding the</p>	<p><b>NBC(D)</b></p>

<p>incinerator be taken up at the appropriate forum rather than this meeting.</p> <p>Qu 14 Mr Avent attended an incinerator road show and expressed concern about health risks, i.e. another discharge in to the Plymouth environment. Can there be a categorical assurance that it will never burn Low Level Waste.</p> <p>A. Mr Hardy replied that Babcock Marine has the licence to deal with Low level waste and it will not ever be burned in any incinerator and as requested they are happy to put this in writing. Any incinerator would have to be authorised and licensed by the Environment Agency and other agencies.</p> <p>13. No other issues were discussed.</p>	
<p><b>Item 10 - AOB</b></p> <p>14. The date of the next meeting is booked as 1000 on the 9 July 2010 at Welcome Hall, Devonport.</p>	
<p><b>Item 11 - Closing Remarks</b></p> <p>15. The Chairman closed the meeting.</p>	

*Signed on Original*

Distribution List:

External:

**Ministry of Defence**

Commodore D Langbridge RN, Director, Defence Nuclear Safety Regulator, Birch 3c, #3333, Abbey Wood Bristol, BS34 8JH.

Commodore I Jess OBE RN, Naval Base Commander, NBHQ, Building M049, HMNB Devonport, Plymouth, PL2 2BG.

Captain J Edgell RN, COMDEVFLOT Captain (SM), Building N019, HMNB Devonport, Plymouth, PL2 2BG.

Captain J J Taylor OBE RN, CBS, NBHQ, Building M049, HMNB Devonport, PL2 2BG.

Surgeon Commander P Benton RN, NMOH, Building B149, FAC, HMS DRAKE, HMNB Devonport, PL2 2BG.

Mr P Wheddon, Principal Inspector, Defence Nuclear Safety Regulator, Birch 3c, #3333, Abbey Wood Bristol, BS34 8JH.

Mr D Black, Principal Inspector, Defence Nuclear Safety Regulator, Birch 3c, #3333, Abbey Wood Bristol, BS34 8JH.

Ms L Coulton, SPRO, NBHQ, Building M049, HMNB Devonport, PL2 2BG.

Chief Inspector S Parker, MoD Police, Newman House, Building N215A, HMNB Devonport, PL2 2BG.

Inspector A Tonks, MoD Police, Newman House, Building N215A, HMNB Devonport, PL2 2BG.

Mr C Bawden, Director Business, Building M049, HMNB Devonport, PL2 2BG.

Mrs S Burrows, SHP (Policy) NBRSD, Howard Block, FAC, HMS DRAKE, HMNB Devonport, PL2 2BG.

Captain M Knibbs RN, CoB, NBHQ, Building M049, HMNB Devonport, PL2 2BG.

**Emergency Services**

Mrs Debbie Simpson, Assistant Chief Constable, Devon and Cornwall Constabulary, Police Headquarters, Middlemoor, Exeter, EX2 7HQ.

Lisabeth Jones, Civil Contingencies and Emergency Planning Officer, Crownhill Police Station, Budshead Way, Plymouth, PL6 5HT

Mr Simon Wilkins, Contingency Planning Unit, Devon and Cornwall Constabulary, Police Headquarters, Middlemoor, Exeter, EX2 7HQ.

**Defence Equipment & Support**

Plymouth BCU Contact – SPOC(Single Point of Contact) Operations Planning, Crownhill Police Station, Budshead Way, Crownhill, Plymouth PL6 5HT.

Mr W Martin, Resilience Officer, (West Division) South West Ambulance Service NHS Trust, Unit 3, Abbey Court, Eagle Way, Exeter, EX2 7HY.

Mr M Killoran, Peninsula Emergency Planning Co-ordinator, South West Ambulance Service NHS Trust, Abbey Court, Eagle Way, Exeter EX3 0NW

Mrs M Marklew, Devon Control Manager, Devon & Somerset Fire and Rescue Service, Brigade Headquarters, The Knowle, Clyst St George, Exeter EX3 0NW

Malcolm Carmichael CMIFireE, Group Commander – Plymouth West and West Devon, Western Command – Plymouth HQ, Glen Road, Plympton, Plymouth, PL7 2XT.

### **Cornwall Council**

Mr R Fedorowicz, Senior Emergency Management Officer, Cornwall Council, emergency management service, Carnon Building, Old County Hall, Truro, Cornwall, TR1 3AY

Mr S Besford-Foster, Community Network Area Manager, Cornwall Council, Luxstowe House, Liskeard, Cornwall, PL14 3DZ

Councillor B Hobbs, 41 Peacock Avenue, Torpoint, Cornwall PL11 2EX

Councillor C Riches 17 Clear View, Saltash, Cornwall PL12 6HD

### **Devon County Council**

Mr R Horne, County Emergency Planning Officer, Devon County Council, County Hall, Room L41, Exeter, EX2 4QD.

Councillor J Hart, Devon County Council, County Hall, Room L41, Exeter, EX2 4QD.

Councillor R Croad, Devon County Council, County Hall, Room L41, Exeter, EX2 4QD

### **Plymouth City Council**

Mr S Senior, Civil Protection Manager, Civil Protection Unit, Plymouth City Council, Prince Rock Depot, Macadam Road, Plymouth, PL4 0RZ

Mr B Keel, Chief Executive and Town Clerk, Plymouth City Council, Civic Centre, Plymouth, PL1 2EW.

Mr G Perritt, Head of Continuous Improvement, Plymouth City Council, Civic Centre, Plymouth, PL1 2EW.

Mr R Carton, Public Protection Manager Public Protection Service 6<sup>th</sup> Floor Civic Centre, Plymouth, PL1 2EW.

## **Defence Equipment & Support**

Mr R Longford, Public Relations Officer, Plymouth City Council, Civic Centre, Plymouth, PL1 2EW.

Councillor Prof. David Salter, 144 Devonport Road, Plymouth, PL1 5RF.

Councillor G Wheeler, 2 Verna Road, St Budeaux, Plymouth, PL5 2EH.

Councillor Dr Steven Ricketts, 5 Mildmay Street, Greenbank, Plymouth, PL4 8NE.

### **South Hams District Council**

Mr D Incoll, Chief Executive, South Hams District Council, Follaton House, Plymouth Road, Totnes, TQ9 5NE.

Mr I Bollans, Chief Environmental Health Officer, South Hams District Council, Follaton House, Plymouth Road, Totnes, TQ9 5NE.

Mr P Dale, Emergency Planner, South Hams District Council, Follaton House, Plymouth Road, Totnes, TQ9 5NE.

Councillor J W Squire, South Hams District Council, 123 Church Road, Wembury, Plymouth, PL9 0LB

### **West Devon Borough Council**

Mr I Luscombe, District Emergency Planning Officer, West Devon Borough Council, Kilworthy Park, Drake Road, Tavistock, PL19 0BZ (2 Copies).

Councillor R Pike, West Devon Borough Council, 25 Courtlands Road, Tavistock, PL19 0EF.

### **Health Organisations**

Dr B Gutteridge, Consultant in Communicable Disease Control, Cornwall Central Primary Care Trust, John Keay House, Tregonissey Road, St Austell, Cornwall, PL25 4NQ.

Dr Mark Kealy, Consultant in Communicable Disease Control, South Hams & West Devon PCT, Lescaze Offices, Shinner's Bridge, Dartington, TQ9 6JE.

Mr C Pallot, Health Emergency Planning Advisor, Health Protection Agency South West, Bonds Mill, Stonehouse, Gloucestershire, GL10 3RF.

Mr G Laverack, Acting Regional Health Planning Advisor, Health Protection Agency, South West Bonds Mill, Stonehouse, Gloucestershire, GL10 3RF.

Ms H Thomas, Regional Health Emergency Planning Assistant, Health Protection Agency, South West Bonds Mill, Stonehouse, Gloucestershire, GL10 3RF.

Dr F Daniel, Consultant in Clinical Oncology, Plymouth Hospital NHS Trust, Derriford Hospital, Derriford Road, Plymouth, PL6 8DH.

Mr S Brown, Asst Director of Public Health, South Hams and West Devon PCT, Lescaze Offices, Shinner's Bridge, Dartington, TQ9 6JE.

### **Defence Equipment & Support**

Dr A Neville, Head of Department, Medical Physics, Level 2, Derriford Hospital, Derriford Road, Plymouth, PL6 8DH.

Ms D Lapthorne, Director of Public Health, NHS Plymouth, The Public Dispensary, 18 Catherine Street, Plymouth, PL1 2AD.

G Vivian, Clinical Director of Nuclear Medicine, Level 6, Derriford Hospital, Derriford Road, Plymouth, PL6 8DH.

Mr N Vine, Emergency Planning Manager, NHS Plymouth, Local Care Centre, 200 Mount Gould Road, Plymouth, PL4 7PY

### **Devonport Royal Dockyard**

Mr A Bethel CBE, Chief Executive, Babcock Marine, PC 109, DRDL, Devonport Royal Dockyard Plymouth, PL1 4SG

Dr D Gilbert CBE, Managing Director, Strategic Development, Babcock Marine, PC 109, DRDL, Devonport Royal Dockyard Plymouth, Plymouth, PL1 4SG.

Mr R Hardy, Managing Director Submarines , PC617, Babcock Marine, DRDL, Devonport Royal Dockyard Plymouth, PL1 4SG.

Mr K Watterson, Nuclear Assurance Manager, Babcock Marine, PC306A, DRDL, Devonport Royal Dockyard Plymouth, PL1 4SG.

Dr A H Francis, Director for Nuclear Safety and Quality, Babcock Marine, PC306A, DRDL, Devonport Royal Dockyard Plymouth, PL1 4SG.

Mr M Lomas, Health, Safety & Environment Manager, Babcock Marine, PC623, DRDL, Devonport Royal Dockyard Plymouth, PL1 4SG.

Mr B Phillips, Emergency Planning Manager, Babcock Marine, PC 1417A, DRDL, Devonport Royal Dockyard Plymouth, PL1 4SG.

Mrs W Smith, Corporate Affairs Manager, Babcock Marine, PC 109, DRDL, Devonport Royal Dockyard Plymouth, PL1 4SG.

### **External Authorities**

Mr P Daybell, SERCO Assurance, MoD Project Registry, Thomson House, Risley, Warrington, Cheshire, PL2 2BG.

Ms J Webber, National Farmers Union, South West Region, Agriculture House, Pynes Hill, Rydon Lane, Exeter, EX2 5ST.

Dr P Naylor, Nuclear Regulator, Environment Agency, Red Kite House, Howberry Park, Wallingford, OX10 8BD.

Station Director (fao R Adcock, Emergency Preparedness Engineer), British Energy, Hinkley Point B Power Station, Nr Bridgewater, TA5 1UD.

### **Defence Equipment & Support**

Mr Mike Moore, HM Principle Inspector, Health and Safety Executive, Nuclear Installations Inspectorate, Redgrave Court, Merton Road, Bootle, L20 7HS.

Mr J Welch, Health and Safety & Security Advisor, South West Water Services Ltd., Peninsula Park, Rydon Lane, Exeter, EX2 7HR.

Mr G Graham, Site Emergency Planner, UK AEA, Winfrith Bldg B71, Dorchester, Dorset DT2 8WG.

Mr S Conney, Head of Assessments Nuclear Sites and Radiological Standards Branch, The Food Standards Agency, Room 719, Aviation House, 125 Kingsway, London, WC2 6NH.

Mr D Haigh, Resilience Unit, Government Office for the South West, Regional Resilience Team, 2 Rivergate, Temple Quay, Bristol, BS1 6ED